Special Review of

Timekeeping Records at Gove Elementary

February 14, 2020

Report #2020-01



MISSION STATEMENT

The School Board of Palm Beach County is committed to providing a world class education with excellence and equity to empower each student to reach his or her highest potential with the most effective staff to foster the knowledge, skills, and ethics required for responsible citizenship and productive careers.

Donald E. Fennoy II, Ed.D. Superintendent of Schools

School Board Members

Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq., Chair Chuck Shaw, Vice Chair Marcia Andrews Karen M. Brill Barbara McQuinn Debra L. Robinson, M.D. Erica Whitfield

Audit Committee Members

David H. Talley, Chair Tammy McDonald Anderson, Vice Chair N. Ronald Bennett, CPA Michael Dixon, CPA/PFS Deborah Manzo Kathleen Weigel, Ed.D. Chandler Williamson

Audit Committee Representatives

Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq., School Board Chair Donald E. Fennoy II, Ed.D., Superintendent of Schools Mike Burke, Chief Financial Officer JulieAnn Rico, Esq., General Counsel Maria Lloyd, Principal Representative Justin Katz, CTA President

Special Review of

Timekeeping Records at Gove Elementary

Table of Contents

	Page
PURPOSE AND AUTHORITY	1
SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1
BACKGROUND	2
CONCLUSIONS	
1. OIG Preliminary Results of Review	3
2. No Adjustment to Leave Time Balances Required for 56 Employees	3
 6,267 Leave Hours Estimated \$247,887 in Value Taken By 85 Employees, But Not Recorded in PeopleSoft Payroll System 	4
APPENDIX	
A. Chronology of Events	8
B. Management's Response – Principal of Gove Elementary School	9
C. Management's Response – Office of the CFO	10

This page intentionally left blank.

Special Review of Timekeeping Records at Gove Elementary

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's (OIG) 2018-2019 Work Plan* and in response to the June 3, 2019, joint request from the Department of Employee and Labor Relations (ELR) and the Principal of Gove Elementary School, we have reviewed the school's Employee Leave Records. The primary objective of this review was to assist ELR in determining if employees' leave and attendance records were accurately entered into the PeopleSoft Payroll System.

Scope of the Review. In May 2019, the Principal of Gove Elementary School noted certain inconsistencies of staff's leave records. On June 3, 2019, ELR and the Principal jointly requested the OIG to assist them in determining the extent of leave hour under-reporting. Section 95.11(4)(c), F.S., limits to two years for the School District to recover the overpayment of wages, if any, from employees. As a result, OIG's assistance to ELR and the Principal in determining the extent of under-reporting in leave time taken could only cover the period during July 1, 2017, through May 10, 2019.

<u>OIG Preliminary Results of Review</u>. The OIG's preliminary review concluded that a total of 7,342 leave hours (estimated \$288,395^{Note (1)} in value) taken by 141 employees were not recorded in the PeopleSoft Payroll System.

<u>No Adjustment to Leave Time Balances Required for 56 Employees</u>. The Principal and Accounting Services Department (Accounting) jointly reviewed the OIG's preliminary results and confirmed that no adjustments of leave balances for 56 employees were needed because (1) the leave hours taken by 54 employees were for attending District sponsored activities, and (2) the two remaining employees had previously signed up to join the *Florida Deferred Retirement Option Program (DROP)* and any adjustments would occur through the annual end-of-year calculation.

<u>Confirmation With Affected Employees</u>. At the August 5, 2019, staff meeting, the Principal and ELR provided the 85 (141 - 56) affected employees the updated results of the discrepancies for leave time taken but not recorded in the PeopleSoft System. Employees were given an opportunity to provide evidence to show their leave hours were for attending District-sponsored events or performing other job-related duties. The Principal and ELR met with each of the affected employees to review and receive new documentation from the employees.

6,267 Leave Hours Estimated \$247,887 in Value Taken By 85 Employees, But Not Recorded in PeopleSoft Payroll System. After the adjustments made by Accounting and confirmation from individual employees, it was concluded that 6,266.50 leave hours taken by 85 employees were not

Note (1): The estimated dollar value of the unrecorded hours includes only hourly wages and does not include the District's contributions in FRS and FICA tax.

recorded in the PeopleSoft Payroll System. These unrecorded leave hours had an estimated value of \$247,887.02.

<u>Payment Options for 85 Employees</u>. Fifty (50) employees had sufficient leave balances to absorb their 3,192 hours in unrecorded leave times (with estimated value of \$131,951.83). Seven (7) employees, with a total of 258.25 unrecorded leave hours at an estimated value of \$12,018.67, were no longer employed by the District. The remaining 28 employees, with a total of 1,934.75 unrecorded leave hours at an estimated value of \$72,938.80, were provided with six options to repay the District based on the balance owed.

<u>\$34K Outstanding as of January 9, 2020</u>. The Office of the CFO indicated that the balance of unrecorded leave times outstanding to the District was \$34K for 13 employees as of January 9, 2020.

<u>Corrective Actions</u>. The Office of the CFO indicated that:

The PeopleSoft ERP Department is currently developing an online absence process. This will allow employees to submit time off requests electronically to their Principal / Director that will post the hours directly onto the employee's timesheet in PeopleSoft. Testing is schedule to begin by Payroll Staff in late January 2020, with potential rollout to the District during FY21.

Job Aides for Payroll Site Administrators are available on the District Hub. Two of these job aids instruct Directors and Principals on the processes of approving time, "How to Approve Time" and "Follow Up Time Approval." Mandatory Payroll training for Principals and Directors has been available in eLM since 2018. In February 2020, a Bulletin is scheduled to be published with these job aides, reminding all Principals and Directors of updated Payroll Training in eLM.

(*Please see page 10.*)



THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL 3318 FOREST HILL BLVD., C-306. WEST PALM BEACH, FL 33406 (561) 434-7335 FAX: (561) 434-8652 www.palmbeachschools.org Hotline: (855) 561-1010 LUNG CHIU, CIG, CPA INSPECTOR GENERAL SCHOOL BOARD FRANK A. BARBIERI, JR, ESQ, CHAIR CHUCK SHAW, VICE CHAIR MARCIA ANDREWS KAREN M. BRILL BARBARA McQUINN DEBRA L. ROBINSON, M.D. ERICA WHITFIELD

DONALD E. FENNOY II, Ed.D., SUPERINTENDENT

MEMORANDUM

- TO: Honorable Chair and Members of the School Board Donald E. Fennoy II, Ed.D., Superintendent of Schools Chair and Members of the Audit Committee
- FROM: Lung Chiu, CPA, Inspector General

DATE: February 14, 2020

SUBJECT: Special Review of Timekeeping Records at Gove Elementary

PURPOSE AND AUTHORITY

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's (OIG) 2018-2019 Work Plan* and in response to the June 3, 2019, joint request from the Department of Employee and Labor Relations (ELR) and the Principal of Gove Elementary School, we have reviewed the school's Employee Leave Records. The primary objective of this review was to assist ELR in determining if employees' leave and attendance records were accurately entered into the PeopleSoft Payroll System.

SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

We interviewed related District and school staff, and reviewed (1) applicable *School Board Policies* and District's payroll procedures, (2) *Florida Statutes Sections* **95.11**(**4**) and **1012.61**(**4**), and (3) the following leave records for July 1, 2017, through May 10, 2019:

- Employees' leave and attendance records in the PeopleSoft System
- Sub-locator database (records of request for substitute teachers)
- Employees' leave requests, i.e. Leave of Absence/Temporary Duty Elsewhere (TDE) Application Forms

After our detailed analysis, we provided the names of employees with questionable leave and attendance records in the Payroll System to the Principal, Department of Employee and Labor Relations, and Department of Accounting Services during the fieldwork so that appropriate actions could be taken immediately.

Draft audit findings were sent to management for review and comments. Management responses are included in the Appendix. We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by District staff during the audit. The final draft report was presented to the Audit Committee at its February 14, 2020, Meeting.

BACKGROUND

<u>Employee Leave Time Taken But Not Recorded</u>. In May 2019, while reviewing the school's budget reports, the Principal of Gove Elementary School noted certain questionable payroll expenses and fund balance for the Substitute Teacher Account. Further review in employee leave requests for substitute teachers revealed that the leave balances of "*staff have not been deducted all the sick or personal time they have taken*."

<u>Principal Requested Assistance from ELR</u>. The Principal noted that her payroll clerk did not always process and enter into the PeopleSoft System employees' leave hours requested and used. As a result, some employees' leave balances were not accurate because leave hours they took were not deducted from their balances. Subsequently, the Principal reported her observation to ELR.

<u>Referral to the OIG</u>. On June 3, 2019, ELR and the Principal jointly requested the OIG to assist them in determining the extent of under-reporting of employees' leave time taken for payroll processing. *Florida Statutes* set certain timeline for the District in recovering the overpayment of wages from employees. Specifically, *Section 95.11(4)(c), F.S.* states,

"An action to recover wages, or overtime, or damages or penalties concerning payment of wages and overtime must be commenced within 2 years".

As a result, our assistance to ELR and the Principal to determine the extent of under-reporting in leave time taken could only cover the period from July 1, 2017, through May 10, 2019.^{Note (2)}

<u>OIG Worked With ELR In Its Investigation</u>. Since ELR had initiated the investigation of this incident, the primary objective of the OIG's involvement was to assist ELR in determining the extent of under-reporting in employees' leave hours.

<u>Referral to School Police</u>. On August 8, 2019, the OIG forwarded the conclusions of the review to School Police for appropriate actions. On October 29, 2019, School Police concluded that no crime was found:

"In regards to the Gove Elementary, where your investigation revealed discrepancies between employees' leave and attendance records, sub-locator database and employees' temporary duty elsewhere. While reviewing the case facts with you and your team, no information came to light, which revealed that a crime was committed."

Note (2): On May 13, 2019, the Payroll Clerk was temporarily reassigned to another work location while the extent of under-reporting was determined. The Clerk's duties were handled by a Regional Office administrative assistant.

CONCLUSIONS

1. OIG Preliminary Results of Review

<u>Methodology</u>. The OIG compared staff's leave applications (TDE) and the sub-locator records (request for substitute teacher when a teacher is on leave) to the Attendance and Leave Records in the PeopleSoft System for all affected employees who worked at Gove Elementary between July 1, 2017, and May 10, 2019.

7,342 Leave Hours Taken By 141 Employees, But Not Recorded in PeopleSoft: Estimated Value \$288,395. OIG's preliminary review concluded that a total of 7,342 leave hours taken by 141 employees were not recorded in the PeopleSoft Payroll System. Based on the related hourly wages for individual employees, these 7,342 unrecorded leave hours had an estimated personnel cost of \$288,395. (Please see Table 1.) During the fieldwork, OIG provided the details of the leave time issue to ELR, the Principal, and the Accounting Services Department (Accounting) for review and appropriate actions.

Employee Type /	# of	FY	2018	FY	2019	Т	otal
Source of	Employees	# of	Estimated	# of	Estimated	# of	Estimated
Discrepancy	Reviewed	Hours	\$	Hours	\$	Hours	\$
Administrators	2						
TDE's		52.00	\$2,491.41	30.00	\$1,437.82	82.00	\$3,929.23
Sub-locator/TCD		0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
Instructional	86						
TDE's		1,389.65	56,940.54	1,577.35	62,797.78	2,967.00	119,738.32
Sub-locator/TCD		1,821.50	76,415.71	1,728.25	73,038.44	3,549.75	149,454.15
Non-Instructional	53						
TDE's		83.75	1,781.08	142.00	4,269.03	225.75	6,050.11
Sub-locator/TCD		191.75	3,214.76	325.75	6,008.69	517.50	9,223.45
Total	141						
TDE's		1,525.40	\$61,213.03	1,749.35	\$68,504.63	3,274.75	\$129,717.66
Sub-locator/TCD		2,013.25	\$79,630.47	2,054.00	\$79,047.13	4,067.25	\$158,677.60
Grand Total		3,538.65	\$140,843.50	3,803.35	\$147,551.76	7,342.00	\$288,395.26

Table 1OIG Preliminary Review ResultsSummary of Unrecorded Leave Times

Note: The estimated dollar value of the unrecorded hours includes only hourly wages and does not include the District's contributions in FRS and FICA tax.

2. No Adjustment to Leave Time Balances Required for 56 Employees

During May 10, through July 29, 2019, Accounting and the Principal jointly reviewed the leave records of each employee in question based on the OIG's preliminary results. Their review confirmed that leave balances for 54 of the 141 employees in question did not require adjustment because their leaves were for attending District-sponsored events. For example,

some sub-locator requests without TDEs were related to teachers' attending on-campus professional development and did not affect leave balances. Accounting also determined that two employees had previously signed up to join the *Florida Deferred Retirement Option Program (DROP)* and any adjustments would occur through the annual end-of-year calculation.

At the August 5, 2019, staff meeting, the Principal and ELR provided the 85 (141 - 56) affected employees the updated results of the discrepancies for leave time taken but not recorded in the PeopleSoft System. Employees were given an opportunity to provide evidence to show their paid attendance. The Principal and ELR met with each of the affected employees to review and receive new documentation from the employees.

3. 6,267 Leave Hours Estimated \$247,887 in Value Taken By 85 Employees, But Not Recorded in PeopleSoft Payroll System

After adjustments by Accounting and confirmation from employees, it was concluded that 6,266.50 leave hours taken by 85 employees were not recorded in the PeopleSoft Payroll System. These unrecorded leave hours for 85 employees had an estimated wages valued \$247,887.02.

50 Employees Had Sufficient Leave Balances to Absorb the Unrecorded Leave Times. Of the 85 employees who took leave time but the hours were not recorded in the PeopleSoft Payroll System, 50 of them had sufficient leave balances as of June 30, 2019, to absorb the unrecorded leave hours. Accounting deducted those unrecorded leave hours from the respective leave balances. These adjustments totaled 3,192 hours, with an estimated value of \$131,951.83. (Please see Table 2).

	# .f	Available Leave	Unrecorded	Leave Hours
Employee Type	# of Employees	Balance (Hours) as of 6/30/2019	# of Hours	Estimated \$
Administrators				
Active	2	394.50	82.00	\$3,976.15
Inactive	0	0.00	0.00	\$0.00
Instructional				
Active	38	10,753.00	2,993.00	\$123,742.15
Inactive	2	185.50	62.50	\$2,315.32
Non-Instructional				
Active	8	1,652.43	54.50	\$1,918.21
Inactive	0	0.00	0.00	\$0.00
Total				
Active	48	12,799.93	3,129.50	\$129,636.51
Inactive	2	185.50	62.50	\$2,315.32
Grand Total	50	12,985.43	3,192.00	\$131,951.83

 Table 2

 Summary of Employees With Sufficient Leave Balances

Note: The estimated dollar value of the unrecorded hours includes only hourly wages and does not include the District's contributions in FRS and FICA tax.

<u>35 Employees Had Insufficient Leave Balances</u>. Thirty-five (35) employees did not have sufficient leave balances to absorb their 2,193 unrecorded leave hours, which had an estimated value of \$84,957.47, and ranged from \$100.70 to \$8,756.59 for the affected employees. (Please see Table 3.)

	# of	Available Leave	Unrecorded Leave Hours		
Employee Type	# of Employees	Balance (Hours) as of 6/30/2019	# of Hours	Estimated \$	
Administrators					
Active	0	0.00	0.00	\$0.00	
Inactive	0	0.00	0.00	\$0.00	
Instructional					
Active	23	937.50	1,763.75	\$68,731.71	
Inactive	5	13.50	219.75	11,499.55	
Non-Instructional					
Active	5	16.25	209.50	\$4,207.09	
Inactive	2	0.00	38.50	519.12	
Total					
Active	28	953.75	1,934.75	\$72,938.80	
Inactive	7	13.50	258.25	12,018.67	
Grand Total	35	967.25	2,193.00	\$84,957.47	

 Table 3

 Summary of Employees Without Sufficient Leave Balances

Note: The estimated dollar value of the unrecorded hours includes only hourly wages and does not include the District's contributions in FRS and FICA tax.

Seven (7) of the above 35 employees, with a total of 258.25 unrecorded leave hours at an estimated value of \$12,018.67, were no longer employed by the District. The remaining 28 employees, with a total of 1,934.75 unrecorded leave hours at an estimated value of \$72,938.80, were provided with six options to repay the District based on the balance owed:

- Option 1 Use up to the value of four advance sick days allocated on August 5, 2019, to cover the overpayment.
- Option 2 Deduct the entire amount from October 4, 2019, paycheck.
- Option 3 Deduct the amount over the corresponding pay periods below beginning with the October 4, 2019, paycheck.

	Over	<u>rpayment</u>	
	<u>From</u>	<u>To</u>	<u># of Pay Periods</u>
\triangleright	\$0	\$249	1
\triangleright	\$250	\$499	2
\triangleright	\$500	\$999	4
\triangleright	\$999	\$1,499	6
\triangleright	\$1,499	\$1,999	8
\triangleright	\$1,999	\$2,499	10

Over	<u>payment</u>	
<u>From</u>	<u>To</u>	<pre># of Pay Periods</pre>
≽ \$2,499	\$2,999	12
▶ \$2,999	\$3,499	14
▶ \$3,499	\$3,999	16
> \$3,999	\$4,499	18
▶ \$4,499	\$4,999	20
≻ \$4,999	\$5,499	22
≻ \$5,499	\$5,999	24
▶ \$5,999	\$6,499	26
≻ \$6,499	\$6,999	28
≻ \$6,999	\$7,499	30

- Option 4 First, reduce the overpayment by the value of four advance sick days allocated on August 5, 2019; and then deduct the remainder in one lump-sum on the October 4, 2019, paycheck.
- Option 5 First reduce the overpayment by the value of four advance sick days allocated on August 5, 2019; and then deduct the remainder based on the overpayment schedule in Option 3.
- Option 6 (Available only if more than 75 hours are to be adjusted) First reduce the overpayment by the value of four advance sick days allocated on August 5, 2019; and then deduct the value of the remaining sick days to be earned in FY2020. The sick leave value will be at the hourly rate on September 1, 2019. The remainder will be deducted based on the overpayment schedule in Option 3. [The employee acknowledges that by choosing this option, all absences in FY2020 will be unpaid.]

<u>**OIG Note</u>**: All relevant information and calculations were provided to the Principal, ELR, and Accounting during our fieldwork for appropriate actions.</u>

Management Responses:

Principal of Gove Elementary: I concur with the conclusion of the IG.

There is currently an open investigation with the Department of Employee and Labor Relations. The case will be reviewed and recommendation made at the conclusion of the investigation.

(*Please see page 9.*)

Office of the CFO: Management concurs with the conclusions of the IG. The balance still outstanding to the District is currently [January 9, 2020] \$34k for 13 employees, with approximately \$2,400 collected each pay period.

The PeopleSoft ERP Department is currently developing an online absence process. This will allow employees to submit time off requests electronically to their Principal / Director that will post the hours directly onto the employee's timesheet in PeopleSoft. Testing is schedule to begin by Payroll Staff in late January 2020, with potential rollout to the District during FY21.

Job Aides for Payroll Site Administrators are available on the District Hub. Two of these job aids instruct Directors and Principals on the processes of approving time, "How to Approve Time" and "Follow Up Time Approval." Mandatory Payroll training for Principals and Directors has been available in eLM since 2018. In February 2020, a Bulletin is scheduled to be published with these job aides, reminding all Principals and Directors of updated Payroll Training in eLM.

(Please see page 10.)

- End of Report -

Chronology of Events

Date	Event
May 2019	The Principal found (1) questionable payroll expenses and fund balance for the Substitute Teacher Account, and (2) the school payroll clerk did not always process and enter employees' leave hours into the PeopleSoft System. The Principal reported her observation to ELR.
May 31, 2019	ELR informed the OIG about the Principal's request for assistance in reconciling employees' leave time records with the PeopleSoft Payroll System.
June 3, 2019	 OIG staff met with the ELR's HR Manager and the Principal to discuss the issue and agreed that: The Principal to provide OIG (a) all school payroll files for FY2018 and
	FY2019, data from sub-locator file and PeopleSoft timekeeping records, and (b) access to the TDE holding box contents.
	• OIG to compare sick-leave balances for instructional and non-instructional staff with corroborating evidence (i.e. TDEs, sub-locator requests, sign-in-sheets, punch-times, and other documents deemed appropriate) for the period July 1, 2017 through May 10, 2019.
	• ELR to determine the appropriate course of action to recoup overpayments from employees.
June 5 through July 9, 2019	• OIG analyzed employees' leave requests and PeopleSoft Payroll records for July 1, 2017, through May 10, 2019.
	• Progress reports were provided to the Principal, ELR, and Accounting Department.
August 5, 2019	• The Principal and ELR discussed with the affected employees the updated status of the review for leave time taken but not recorded.
	• Employees were allowed to provide evidence to show their leave hours were for attending District's sponsored events or performing job-related duties.
	• Employees were provided with six options to repay the District based on the balance owed.
	• Subsequently, after adjustments by Accounting and confirmation from individual employees, it was concluded that 6,266.50 leave hours (with estimated \$247,887 in value) taken by 85 employees were not recorded in the PeopleSoft Payroll System.
August 8, 2019	OIG forwarded the conclusions to School Police for further actions. School Police concluded that no crime was committed.
January 9, 2010	The balance due to the District was \$34K from 13 employees, with approximately \$2,400 collected each pay period.

Chronology of Events For Unrecorded Leave Hours for Employees at Gove Elementary

Management's Response Principal of Gove Elementary School

P	1000 S.E Belle Glad	entary School Avenue G de, FL 33430 e) – (561)993-8750 (Fax)	Kimberly Thomasson PRINCIPAL Ana Groover ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL
Memora	andum	DECE	VED
To:	Lung Chiu	JAN 10	2029
From:	Kim Thomasson	INSPECTOR	GENERAL
Date:	January 10, 2020		
Subject:	Response to Special Review	of Timekeeping Records at Go	ve Elementary
I concur wi	th the conclusion of the IG.		
Relations. the investig	irrently an open investigation with The case will be reviewed and re pation.	commendation made at the co	and Labor nclusion of
2			

Management's Response *Office of the CFO*

SCHOOL DA	THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FL CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICE 3300 FORIST HILL BOULEVARD, C-316 West PALM BEACH, FL 33406	MICHAEL J. BURKE CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER	Donald E. Fennoy II, Ed.D. Superintendent
W BEACH COU	PHONE: 561-434-8584 / FAX: 561-357-7585 WWW.PALMBEACHSCHOOLS.ORG/CFO		
Мемор	ANDUM		RECEIVEN
TO:	Lung Chiu, Inspector General		JAN - 9 2020
FROM:	Michael J. Burke, Chief Financial Officer	s IN	SPECTOR GENERA
DATE:	January 9, 2020		
SUBJECT:	Response to Special Review of Timekeeping	Records at Gove Elen	ientary
Management to recommen	reviewed the Report related to Timekeeping Rei dations.	ords at Gove Element	ary and has the following response
Management 13 employees	concurs with the conclusions of the IG. The ba , with approximately \$2,400 collected each pay p	lance still outstanding seriod.	to the District is currently \$34k f
time off reque	It ERP Department is currently developing an on ests electronically to their Principal / Director that Testing is scheduled to begin by Payroll Staff	will post the hours dire	ectly onto the employee's timesha
Principals on t training for Pr	Payroll Site Administrators are available on the he processes of approving time, "How to Approve incipals and Directors has been available in eLM in these job aides, reminding all Principals and Dir	Time" and "Follow Up lince 2018. In Februar	Time Approval." Mandatory Payro v 2020, a Bulletin is scheduled to it
MJB/NS:mw			
Ange Vicki	Oswald, Deputy Superintendent/Chief of School a Avery-Moore, Regional Superintendent, Glade Evans-Pare, Director of Employee and Labor Rela y Samuels, Director of Accounting	Regional Office	
Randy Kim T	y Law, Director of Audit, Office of Inspector Gene homasson, Principal, Gove Elementary School ensen, Manager of Payroll, Accounting Services	ral	